

**Montana Transportation Commission
Minutes
November 9, 2022**

For additional information, please call (406) 444-7200 or visit the commission's web site at http://www.mdt.mt.gov/pubinvolve/trans_comm/meetings.shtml.
For the hearing impaired, the TTY numbers are (406) 444-7696 or 1-800-335-7592 or call the Montana Relay at 711. Alternative accessible formats of this document will be provided upon request.

The Montana Transportation Commission met via Zoom on November 9th the meeting was called to order by Commissioner Frazier at 9:00 a.m. with the following participants:

Tammi Fisher, Commissioner (District 1) - **Excused**
Shane Sanders, Commissioner (District 2) - **Excused**
Loran Frazier, Commissioner (District 3)
Noel Sansaver, Commissioner (District 4)
Scott Aspenlieder, Commissioner (District 5)
Chris Nygren, MDT
Val Wilson, MDT
Jake Goettle, MDT
Lori Ryan, MDT
Ryan Dahlke, MDT
Paul Johnson, MDT
Meghan Strahan, MDT
Kelly Williams, MDT
Tammy Ross, MDT
Miki Lloyd, MDT
Lucia Olivera, FHWA

Awards: Jake Goettle presented information regarding the staff recommendations for the following projects:

October 27, 2022 – Letting

Call No	Project Number	UPN	Project Description	District	Bid Amount	Contractor
201	NHPB 94-1(86)14	9585000	I-94 BR PRES MP 14-21	Billings	\$ 8,334,391.60	SLETTEN CONSTRUCTION COMPANY GREAT FALLS, MT
202	NH 57-6(18)267	9455000	CIRCLE - SOUTHWEST	Glendive	\$ 5,649,570.75	PRINCE, INC. FORSYTH, MT
203	IM 90-3(148)150, IM 90-3(150)162	9866000, 9867000	DRUMMOND - E & W, GOLD CREEK - E & W	Missoula	\$ 4,997,921.10	RIVERSIDE CONTRACTING, INC. MISSOULA, MT
204	STPP 13-1(61)8	9942000	JCT MT 87 - NORTHWEST (US-287)	Butte	\$ 5,099,990.00	SHELLINGER CONSTRUCTION CO., INC. COLUMBIA FALLS, MT
205	STPP 14-5(37)166	8724000	ROUNDUP - WEST	Billings	\$ 3,888,888.77	WICKENS CONSTRUCTION, INC. LEWISTOWN, MT
206	STPP 83-2(23)48	9865000	SWAN LAKE - SOUTH	Missoula	\$ 3,435,435.00	KNIFE RIVER CORPORATION – MSLA MISSOULA, MT
208	STPP 13-2(16)82	9730000	SAPPINGTON - NORTHEAST	Butte	\$ 2,336,262.05	KNIFE RIVER CORPORATION – BELG BELGRADE, MT

210	NH 1-1(114)20	9993000	US-2 SLOPE STABILITY	Missoula	\$ 1,475,125.48	HI-TECH ROCKFALL CONSTRUCTION, INC. FOREST GROVE, OR
211	NH 5-2(188)49, HSIP 24(66)	9861000, 9894000	SPRING CR RD - MINESINGER TRL, SF 189 GLOVER ROAD SAFETY	Missoula	\$ 2,322,268.95	RIVERSIDE CONTRACTING, INC. MISSOULA, MT
212	NH 57-1(13)0	9955000	ARMINGTON JUNCTION - EAST	Great Falls	\$ 2,140,120.00	VSS INTERNATIONAL, INC. WEST SACRAMENTO, CA
213	IM 94-4(92)129	9174000	I-94 FENCING - MILES CITY AREA	Glendive	\$ 1,433,636.74	KLUVER FENCING COMPANY, LLC FORSYTH, MT
214	STPP 29-4(38)75	9736000	BUTTE - SOUTHEAST	Butte	\$ 520,738.18	JEFFERY CONTRACTING, LLC BUTTE, MT
215	NH 60-2(124)82	9956000	GREAT FALLS - EAST	Great Falls	\$ 688,130.66	UNITED MATERIALS OF GREAT FALLS, INC. GREAT FALLS, MT

Fifteen (15) projects were advertised and a total of thirty-two (32) bids have been received. Staff recommends awarding projects to the responsive low bidders.

Commissioner Sansaver moved to approve the award of projects 201, 202, 203, 204, 205, 206, 208, and 210 to the responsive low bidders, Commissioner Aspenlieder seconded the motion, all Commissioners voted aye.

2. Result of Design-Build Selection Process: SF 189 D2 HT Median Cable Rail, HSIP STWD (744), UPN 9797000.

Background:

MDT has initiated a Design-Build project intended to design and install High-Tension Median Barrier Rail along the Interstate 15 Corridor from Mile Post 116.0-134.1, and along the Interstate 90 Corridor from Mile Post 208.3-219.0, 227.0-230.5, & 274.8-315.0 to address cross-median crashes. Proposed improvements include median slope flattening (where necessary), modifications as necessary to mitigate corresponding drainage issues, and installation of high-tension cable rail.

The Request for Qualifications (RFQ) package for the subject project was advertised on June 3, 2022. Statement of Qualification (SOQ) responses were received from three design-build teams (Firms) on June 24, 2022. A Technical Review Committee (TRC) consisting of five MDT staff members from various project-related disciplines independently evaluated and scored the SOQ submittals from the three Firms based on the established Evaluation Criteria and Scoring Guide. The TRC produced a ranked short-list of three Firms that were invited to submit Proposals. Request for Proposal (RFP) packages were issued to the three short-listed Firms on July 8, 2022.

PROPOSAL SUMMARY:

Three Technical Proposals were received on September 8, 2022. The Technical Review Committee evaluated proposals and discussed the evaluation criteria during one scoring review meeting. The Selection Committee approved the final Technical Proposal scores on September 26, 2022. Bid Price Proposals were received on October 20, 2022, and were publicly opened at 11:00 AM. Proposals were received from the following Firms:

- Poteet/WGM
- Coral Construction/DJ&A
- Mountain West Holding Company/DOWL

The Technical Proposal Score provided 60% of the maximum score available and the Bid Price Proposal provided 40% of the maximum score available. The following formulas are used to calculate the Best Value. The Firm with the highest Total Points is considered the Best Value.

1. 60 points – Technical Proposal

$$\frac{\text{Firms Technical Proposal Score}}{\text{Total Points Available}} * 60 = \text{Technical Proposal Awarded Points}$$
2. 40 points – Bid Price Proposal

$$\frac{\text{Lowest Responsive Total Cost}}{\text{Firms Total Cost}} * 40 = \text{Cost Proposal Awarded Points}$$
3. Technical Proposal Awarded Points + Cost Proposal Awarded Points = Total Points

As noted above, the Selection Committee reviewed and approved the Bid Price Proposals and Technical Proposal evaluation and scoring information provided by the TRC. The following is a summary of the scoring results.

The Engineer’s Estimate for this project was \$17,541,000.00.

FIRM	TECHNICAL PROPOSAL SCORE	BID PRICE PROPOSAL AMOUNT	BEST VALUE TOTAL POINTS
Poteet/WGM	41,420	\$23,505,150.00	80.808
Coral/DJ&A	43,990	\$18,277,777.00	92.788
MWHC/DOWL	39,410	\$25,300,000.00	76.190

In accordance with the Design-Build Guidance Document and the Request for Proposals, the Selection Committee is authorized to approve the best-value bid price provided it does not exceed 25% of the engineer’s estimate. The best-value bid price submitted by Coral Construction does not exceed the 25% threshold of \$21,926,250.00.

Based on the above scoring information, the Selection Committee recommends the following:

1. Recommend the two unsuccessful responsive Firms receive the stipend payment of \$70,000.
2. Award the contract to the Coral Construction/DJ&A Design-Build Team, with the highest technical score, lowest bid price and the Best-Value for MDT, in the amount of \$18,277,777.00.
3. Significant points to support this recommendation include:
 - a. This recommendation follows the process established in the Design-Build Guidance Document.
 - b. This recommendation is in accordance with MCA § 18-2-502 (3).
 - c. Based on their team's design and project approach, the Coral Construction/DJ&A Design-Build Team had the highest overall technical proposal score. The Coral Construction/DJ&A Design-Build Team had the highest Technical Proposal Score and the lowest Bid Price Proposal.
 - d. The Coral Construction/DJ&A proposal had a substantial completion date in accordance with the RFP.

Commissioner Aspenlieder moved to approve the staff recommendation and stipend to the responsive bidder, Commissioner Sansaver seconded the motion, all Commissioners voted aye.